A NOTE ON THE 'SOUTHERN ALPS' OF NEW ZEALAND.

By DOUGLAS W. FRESHFIELD.

I CANNOT begin in the formula that threatens to become classical in these pages—*my attention has been called*—because my eyesight does not yet compel me to read even the small print of the 'Alpine Journal' by proxy. But I have noticed in the number for last August a continuation by Mr. A. P. Harper of the correspondence on the relative claims of New Zealand travellers and surveyors, and I observe that he gives, as his main motive for writing, a statement I made in my address delivered as President to the Alpine Club in December 1895.

My statement ran as follows:—

Mr. FitzGerald 'proved the practical utility of climbing by finding for the colonists the easy and direct pass they have so long wanted and so long sought to the West Coast.' Mr. Harper 'submits he has not done so,' and asserts that my expression shows 'how erroneous an impression had been conveyed.'

I have judged it expedient, in order that any answer I might make should be final, to wait to reply until after the appearance of Mr. Harper's long-promised volume on his own explorations. I have now had the pleasure of reading his book, as well as, I believe, almost all that has been written on the New Zealand Alps recently or in past years. In the result I cannot see my way to make any alteration in my statement, which it appears to me is most fully borne out both by geographical facts and official documents. I cannot believe that my words could convey any erroneous impression to an audience, or to readers, who were presumably acquainted with Mr. Harper's and Mr. Mannering's papers in the last volume of the 'Alpine Journal,' and had had the summary of Mr. FitzGerald's exploits recently before them.*

In the first place the reports of Von Haast in 1865, and of Mr. Strauchon, chief surveyor of Westland, in 1892–3, are conclusive as to the want felt in the colony of a pass from the Mackenzie Plains to the West Coast. Mr. Strauchon writes (p. 39): 'Another very important work on which I hope to be able to employ Mr. Douglas is the exploration of a tourist route between the West Coast and the Hermitage, *viâ* the Kangarua, Landsborough, and Hopkins valleys. The finding and construction of a tourists' route, if only a bridle track, would do wonders towards opening up the beauties of Southern Westland.' This particular route was reported against by Mr. Harper in 1895 as too rough and roundabout; Mr. Douglas, who was sent up the Copland valley in 1892, having previously reported that there was no practicable pass in that direction. The opening sentence of Mr. Douglas's official report runs as follows: 'I have failed in the main object—namely, to discover a pass available for

* *Alpine Journal*, vol. xvii. pp. 153, 316, 469.

a road across the main range to the Hermitage.' Such a pass was first recognised and crossed in 1895 by Mr. FitzGerald, and Mr. Harper's subsequent report, quoted below, proves that FitzGerald's Pass can be, and Mr. Harper thinks must be, ultimately made into a horse track. Expense, he informs us, is the only ground for delay.

As far as I am personally concerned in the discussion, I think it would hardly be necessary for me to say more. But my friend Mr. Keltie, the Secretary of the Royal Geographical Society, has placed in my hands a letter sent him for publication by the Hon. Secretary of the New Zealand Alpine Club (see p. 333), and we have agreed, with the assent of Sir Clements Markham, that it would be for the public convenience if the discussion initiated in this Journal were concluded in the same place, rather than in the Journal of the Geographical Society. Mr. FitzGerald is now in the Andes. His absence makes it the more requisite to point out where, and to what extent, the local feelings of the colonists are leading them into criticisms and contradictions that cannot be sustained.

Not content with a general observation—which few would have contested—that the young climber's work *as an explorer* had been made too much of in this country,* his colonial critics have denied his claim to 'the first crossing of the Southern Alps,' and blamed the Royal Geographical Society for having recorded without protest a paper with this title. At that time I was in no way responsible for the conduct of the Society, I was not present at the Meeting when Mr. FitzGerald read his paper, and I should not myself have given it that title; but I none the less feel it my duty to point out that his critics are themselves chiefly to blame for its ambiguity.

Let us look back to the mountaineering literature of New Zealand, the works of Von Haast, Von Hochstetter, Von Lendenfeld, Green, Mannering, and Harper.† But before we take up their volumes it may be well to note, in passing, that the belief that Captain Cook gave the name *Southern Alps* to the *whole* of the mountains of the South Island is not at all borne out by the map attached to his 'Voyages.' There the Southern Alps are made to terminate in a

* We must in fairness, however, note that the Editor of the *New Zealand Alpine Journal* (vol. i. p. 54) has expressed an appreciation of Mr.FitzGerald's work very different to Mr. Mannering's. 'From February 19 to March 11, Mr. FitzGerald spent his time in crossing a saddle between the Footstool and Mount Stokes, going down the Copland River, and returning from the West Coast with Mr. A. P. Harper *vid* the Franz Josef Glacier over into the Tasman again. We hope to publish his Journal, or copious extracts from it, in our next number. It teems with incident, *discovery*, and adventure.' The italics are mine.

† *The Geology of Canterbury and Westland*, by Julius von Haast, F.R.S. (Christchurch, 1879); *New Zealand*, by Dr. von Hochstetter (London, 1867); *The High Alps of New Zealand*, by the Rev. W. S. Green (London, 1883); 'Der Tasman Gletscher und seine Umgebung,' by Dr. von Lendenfeld, *Petermann's Mitteilungen* (Ergänzungsheft No. 75), 1884; *With Axe and Rope in the New Zealand Alps*, by G. Mannering (London, 1891); *Pioneer Work in the Alps of New Zealand*, by A. P. Harper (London, 1896).

broad gap about 43° S. latitude, and the mountains N.W. of Bank's Peninsula are marked as separate ranges, and called 'Snowey (*sic*) Mountains.' It is further proper to point out that on the map of New Zealand (1 : 1,000,000) engraved by Mr. Ravenstein for the Colonial Goverment in 1876, the final S in 'Southern Alps' is placed in close proximity to Whitcombe's Pass *—almost, that is, on the same spot as by Captain Cook. I do not myself attach any very great importance to indications of this kind on maps, but in a purely technical matter they are at least evidence of the view of the cartographers concerned.

Let us return to our books. Von Haast, no doubt, continually uses the expression *Southern Alps* as covering the whole elevations from cape to cape of the South Island. I have searched his 'Geology of Canterbury' in vain for any such definition of the Southern Alps (Haast's Pass to Arthur's Pass) as Mr. Mannering—unfortunately without giving any reference—has attributed to him. I find, on the contrary, many passages in that standard work which are absolutely inconsistent with the limitation suggested.†

Von Haast describes at some length, without giving it any distinctive name, what I may perhaps call the central chain of the Southern Alps, the unbroken snow-crest that extends from near Haast's to Whitcombe's Pass.

The following sentence (p. 180) deserves quotation: 'On the west side of Whitcombe's Pass rises the magnificent pyramid of Mount Whitcombe, and from here to Haast's Pass the Alps, with their enormous masses of snow and ice, form for nearly 100 miles an impassable barrier between the two coasts to the traveller, except to the mountaineer, who, alpenstock and ice-axe in hand, can cross over several cols by ascending a glacier on one side, and after passing a névé saddle descending a similar stream on the other.'

Hochstetter included in the *Southern Alps* all the snowy ranges south of Harper's Pass (pp. 478–482).

Mr. Green succeeds with the following passage (p. 69): 'Crossing the straits to the southward, we find in the provinces of Nelson and Marlborough a number of high Alpine ranges enclosing charming valleys. Further S. these ranges draw together till *in the great range called by Captain Cook the Southern Alps* they assume the form of a great mountain wall sending off numerous spurs, rising into bold Alpine peaks, and for over 100 miles possessing no col or pass free from eternal snow and ice.' ‡

Dr. von Lendenfeld adds topographical details. 'The first pass under 2,500 metres to the N. of Haast's Pass is the Whitcombe Pass, 100 miles distant. The part of the Divide between these

* The existence of this pass, a green gap (4,212 ft.), was first indicated to the surveyors by Mr. Samuel Butler, who, in his fantastic romance *Erewhon*, gave a vivid picture of the New Zealand Alps.

† See chapters i. ii.; section, 'Physical Geography.'

‡ I can find nothing on p. 69 of Mr. Green's book to explain Mr. Harper's reference to it (*A. J.* vol. xviii. p. 202) as indicating that Mr. Green fixed the limits of the Southern Alps at Haast's and Harper's Passes.

two passes contains the highest summit in New Zealand; the lofty ice-clad ridge sinks nowhere under 2,000 metres, and its mean height may be taken as 2,500 metres. In all this chain there is no pass free from snow.'

None of these writers attempts any precise limitation of the term Southern Alps. Mr. Green, it is true, by implication excludes the ranges of Nelson and Marlborough, and includes the peaks S. of Haast's Pass. Mr. Mannering* is the first to define for us the '*Southern Alps proper.*' 'The Southern Alps proper,' he writes, 'may be said to extend over a distance of about 100 miles of the middle part of the South Island.'

Mr. Harper, in his article in the 'Geographical Journal' (January 1893), and again in his book, written before mid-March 1896, paraphrases very closely—without quoting—Mr. Green. 'Further, S. these ranges draw together, till, in the Southern Alps, they form a great mountain wall running from N.E. to S.W., which sends off a number of spurs rising into bold Alpine peaks, and for upwards of 100 miles presents a snowy barrier, *crossed last season for the first time by a pass lying at the head of the Godley Glacier, to the N.E. of the district embraced in the map.*' The words I have italicised are omitted in Mr. Harper's subsequent book, and 'between the West and East Coast districts' substituted for them. But Mr. Harper goes further—in his article. He proceeds to give details as to this snowy barrier and its passes.

'On the main range,' he tells us, 'four saddles have been successfully reached—namely, the Godley Saddle, reached by Sealy in 1869, and crossed in 1892 by Mannering and Lean for a short distance towards the West Coast; the saddle at the head of the Tasman, by Von Lendenfeld; that at the head of the Hooker by Blakiston and myself; and on the Mueller, the Burron Saddle, in 1889, by Brodrick's Survey party.'

In a previous paragraph Mr. Harper had informed his readers that 'Mannering and Lean made a descent to the head of a valley on the West Coast, but, owing to a mishap, were unable to proceed any further.'† Mr. Harper, therefore, is clearly responsible for having in 1893 led the Geographical Society to believe that no complete crossing to the West Coast of what he terms the main range of the Southern Alps had been effected prior to that date. His information, however, as I shall shortly have to show, was incomplete and somewhat misleading.

Now let us take Mr. Mannering's letter and compare his statement with his colleague's. The first four passes in his list are not within 100 miles of Haast's Pass, or among the passes of the main range of the Southern Alps catalogued by Mr. Harper. The fifth and twelfth are the boundaries of this main range.

Neither from Strauchon's nor Fyfe's Pass did the party descend to the West Coast. Graham's and FitzGerald's Passes were first traversed by Mr. FitzGerald himself. There remain only Sealy's

* *With Axe and Rope*, p. 2. † See also *N. Z. A. J.* vol. i. p. 59.

Pass and Brodrick's Pass. Mr. Mannering's first reference shows that the New Zealand Club party which crossed Sealy's Pass were prevented by an accident from completing the expedition. But he has omitted—and it is a curious omission—to insist in any way on a statement (covered by his second reference) which was repeated in his own paper in the 'Alpine Journal' of August 1894, that in March 1892 'The Messrs. Pringle (two) and Blythe crossed the Sealy Pass and reached civilisation on the western side.' This expedition was clearly the first complete crossing of 'the Southern Alps' in the sense in which the term is used by Mr. Harper in his paper communicated to the Geographical Society.

Brodrick's Pass—a roundabout route—far to the S. and near Haast's, had, no doubt, been discovered and reached before Mr. FitzGerald's visit, but, so far as I know, there is no record of its complete crossing to the West Coast, and Mr. Harper has emphatically pronounced against it on the ground not only of its circuitousness but of its roughness.*

From these extracts the attentive reader has had an opportunity of gathering some impression of the nature of the unbroken range extending for 100 miles between Haast's and Whitcombe's Passes. An Alpine comparison may aid him to appreciate the singular importance of this central crest in the orography of the island. It would find its parallel if the central crest of the Alps was uninterruptedly snowy from the neighbourhood of the Little St. Bernard to the St. Gotthard, and if the inhabitants of Bern and Vallais had to go round to one or other of those passes when they wished to traverse the chain with quadrupeds. When Mr. FitzGerald landed in New Zealand no horses or cattle—it seems probable no human being, except the Messrs. Pringle and Blythe—had ever reached the townships of the West Coast over any gap in this portion of the watershed.

Further north and south glacier groups are found, but they are divided from one another by low green gaps, about 3,000–4,200 ft. in height, for the most part traversable, and long since traversed. Among these gaps are Harper's and Arthur's Passes, the former of which lies about 50 miles from Whitcombe's and 150 miles from Haast's, the latter 135 miles from Haast's Pass.

It appears to me a natural inference from these facts and books that the term 'Southern Alps,' if from a geologist's point of view applicable to the hills from cape to cape, is, from an orographer's point of view, more peculiarly applicable to the ice-clad portion of the range, and has been often so applied. Colonial mountaineers, however, seem still to be at cross purposes, not only with one another, but with themselves. Thus Mr. Mannering's limitation of the Southern Alps to 'about 100 miles' cannot possibly carry them 135 miles from

* See *Reports*, 1893–4 and 1895–6. Mr. Brodrick in the latter casts doubt on Mr. Harper's having rightly identified and reached his pass; he has, however (*Reports*, 1889–90), himself written, 'The pass over the Saddle can never be made anything but a passable footpath.'

Haast's Pass to Arthur's. And Mr. Harper, who talks of the 'grave mistake' of all who do not know that 'the Southern Alps have always been considered to extend from Harper's Pass to Haast's Pass in the far south,'* has forgotten not only Mr. Mannering's dictum as to the extent of 'the Southern Alps proper,' and that Mr. Green includes Mount Earnslaw among the Southern Alps, but also his own previous articles and the fact that he has himself in his book stated that the principal glaciers and ice-clad peaks of the Southern Alps lie between 48° and 45° S. (p. 7). Haast's Pass is only seven miles south of 44°.

The conclusion I come to, therefore, is that a visitor to the colony might reasonably assume that in using the term 'Southern Alps' in connection with mountaineering he would be taken to mean the central portion of the chain, which had been apparently defined by two secretaries of the New Zealand Alpine Club as the 'Southern Alps proper,' and that in claiming 'the first crossing' of this range he would be understood to refer to a complete crossing of the chain, and not to a mere passage of the snows of the Divide, in which the explorers returned by the way they came, without attempting to encounter the forests on the way to the coast. This was what I had understood Mr. FitzGerald's intention to be, and had he maintained this position, and explained that he had been led, as we all were led for a time, by Mr. Harper's paper in the 'Geographical Journal' to overlook the reference to the complete crossing of Sealy's Pass by Messrs. Pringle and Blythe contained in Mr. Mannering's paper in the 'Alpine Journal,' his defence would, I think, have satisfied all reasonable persons. But Mr. FitzGerald, in his letter to this Journal (p. 41), has taken up a different and, in my opinion, wholly untenable position. In that letter he treats Sealy's Pass as outside the limits of the Southern Alps, thus indicating that he regards that term as equivalent with what is shown in the Map published in the Royal Geographical Society's 'Journal' (vol. i.), and there described as 'the central portion of the Southern Alps.' I have found no authority for so narrow a limitation, and until Mr. FitzGerald had given his explanation it was, I think, impossible for geographers to assume or anticipate that he was writing from this apparently original point of view. It was, I think, equally impossible for us to foresee that critics would be found seriously to suggest that Mr. FitzGerald's paper was an attempt to impose a claim to the first crossing of the island —that is, of a range traversed for thirty years by a well-known carriage road—on (of all bodies in the world) the Royal Geographical Society, which had recently given Von Haast one of its gold medals for his travels in this very region, and printed Mr. Harper's own paper on 'New Zealand Glaciers.' Such a fraud would hardly escape detection in a Village Institute or a Board School.

In the preceding pages I have discussed the use of the expression

* *Alpine Journal*, vol. xviii., p. 202.

Southern Alps solely from the historical point of view. I have shown that Von Haast, writing as a geologist, used it to cover the whole watershed of the South Island, that many orographers and travellers (myself among the number in the Badminton 'Mountaineering') have used it to designate at least all the glacier-bearing groups. In the first volume of the 'Journal of the New Zealand Alpine Club' there are several passages inconsistent with any other sense than this, but a clear definition is wanting. Mr. Harper and Mr. Mannering have, however, defined the *Southern Alps proper* as an unbroken range about 100 miles in length, extending to the N.W. from Haast's Pass. This description is only applicable, with any approach to accuracy, to the chain between Haast's and Whitcombe's Passes. *Since Mr. FitzGerald's visit to the island*, however, Mr. Harper has written to tell the Alpine Club that it is a matter of common knowledge that the Southern Alps extend from Haast's Pass to the pass that bears his own patronymic—that is, 153 miles—and Mr. Mannering has written to tell the Geographical Society that they extend to Arthur's Pass—135 miles. The Surveyor-General, on the contrary, in the 1895–6 'Report' (p. xii) clearly excludes from his consideration in reckoning the passes over the Southern Alps all gaps N. of Whitcombe's Pass.

It is manifest, I think, that while we have none of us been agreed as to what we were talking about, some of us have been both positive and vague. The combination is not an uncommon one. So much for the past. As to the future, I trust that the local authority—the heads of the Survey—will define officially the use of the term 'Southern Alps.' In my opinion no definition which includes the detached glacier ranges N. of Whitcombe's Pass, while excluding Mount Earnslaw, Mount Aspiring, and the other high peaks S. of Haast's Pass, is either worthy of scientific consideration or practically convenient. The term should either be restricted to the continuous central icy crest or extended so as to include at least all the glacier-covered ranges in the island. This latter course seems to me preferable, and it would have the incidental advantage of being a return to the indication of Captain Cook.

On other points the attempted depreciation of Mr. FitzGerald's particular discovery breaks down more conclusively. It has been asserted that the pass now known as FitzGerald's Pass had been discovered by the surveyors (although they had not crossed it) previous to FitzGerald's and Zurbriggen's journey. It has further been asserted that the pass does not fulfil the requirements of the New Zealand Government. The first allegation is in direct contradiction to the 1892 report of Mr. Douglas, the surveyor employed to look for a pass from The Hermitage to the Copland valley; the second is a technical plea rather than a substantial and practical objection.

Mr. Douglas's own narrative of his 1892 explorations is the best proof that he did not find the pass. He actually saw it, but failed to recognise or investigate it. This is what he wrote: 'An open spur leads up to the crown of the Divide, a height of 6,000 ft. above

sea level.* The top was bare of snow when I saw it first, but it must be remembered that in ordinary seasons the usual winter fall might not melt and this pass may be considered as covered with perpetual snow. We saw this pass when it was bare, but a heavy fall of snow prevented explorations in that quarter, and, although the snow came off most of the hills in a day or two, it never left the pass or the higher peaks.' That is all he says, and when he comes to the practical conclusion to be drawn from his labours he ignores altogether this 'pass,' which he did not make any effort to approach. I continue the quotation :—

'I now come to the main object for which I was sent out—that was, to determine the practicability of a route for a mule- or horse-track from "The Hermitage" across the Alps to the West Coast *viâ* Hooker Valley and Baker's Saddle. I am sorry to have to state that, in my opinion, the proposed route is impracticable—impossible I will not say, for it would, no doubt, be possible to tunnel under glaciers, névés, &c.; but such an undertaking may be put on one side at present. It is a great pity, as a route through Baker's Saddle would be very short, and would open up some of the most splendid scenery around Mount Cook. I am well aware that in many of the mountain regions of the earth tracks are taken through some of the most impossible-looking cañons, along beetling cliffs, under galleries, and through tunnels. But how to take a road over a sloping ice-field, which is continually swept by avalanches, is a puzzle to me, and such is a portion of the proposed route. The Strauchon Glacier, as shown in the sketch, is flanked by towering cliffs; then it widens out to the saddle into snow-fields from Banks's Peak and Mount Stokes, both névés coming down from the tops of the ranges to the glacier without a break in their slopes.

'However, as some enterprising explorer may consider I am wrong, and that a route over the saddle is to be got, I will point out the best road-line down the valley. From the cliffs under Banks's Peak to the Lower Forks there is no difficulty whatever; two short bridges over the Douglas River and Architect Creek are all that would be required, outside of the usual sidings and level crossings. I have examined both sides of the river the whole way up, and the line marked on the map is the best route to avoid natural obstacles. Of course, if a special survey were made, there would doubtless be many modifications of my line; and if a trans-insular road is never taken *viâ* the Copland, a practical route laid down on a map is always useful, as no one can tell what may turn up in a new country.'

Mr. Douglas, of whom I would speak with all the respect due to the man to whom we owe most of our knowledge of the western slope and its ravines, gave all his attention, as his map shows, to the wrong valley, and could propose nothing better than a tunnel from its head. He regarded, and depicted on his map as practically and permanently snow and ice-clad, the western side of the ridge, which

* Has the height of the pass been accurately ascertained? Mr. Brodrick, a surveyor, in the 1895–6 *Report*, gives its height as 7,180 ft.

has now been found not to be so.* Imagine a surveyor sent up to Macugnaga to examine the chain coming back with a report that the Weissthor would need a tunnel, and dismissing the Monte Moro as not worth consideration. The parallel is not an unfair one.

To clinch the matter, Mr. Harper tells us that at Christmas 1894 he received an invitation from Mr. Mannering, who was 'anxious he should *find* some pass over to The Hermitage and join them' (p. 210); and further on (p. 270), that in March he was just starting to 'inspect the range' at the head of the Copland, in the belief that it afforded 'the only likely route,' when Mr. FitzGerald arrived from the pass.

There is surely an appreciable difference, in the opinion of most mountaineers, between hoping that something may 'turn up,' or even holding that there 'is a likely route,' and discovering and crossing a new pass.

Next as to the question of practical utility: How far have the requirements of the New Zealand Government been met? What they wanted was, says Mr. Harper (p. 179), 'a pass by which a road or track for tourists could be taken from The Hermitage to the West Coast. They require the pass to be free from snow or ice for three months in the year.' Now FitzGerald's Pass, on Mr. Harper's own showing, in contradiction to Mr. Mannering's hasty assertions, satisfies the *substantial* requirements of the Government.

'No doubt,' writes Mr. Harper, '*a track could be taken over it, and it will have to be accepted as the best and only route in the course of time*' (p. 324). I might quote Mr. Harper at much greater length did space allow. The following sentence must, however, suffice: 'I am of opinion that the only direct and practical route for a pass between The Hermitage and the West Coast is *viâ* some Saddle west of the Footstool, and FitzGerald's Pass is the best of these' ('Report' 1894–5, p. 110). His report and book show clearly that expense is the only difficulty in opening a horse-track over FitzGerald's Pass, and neither affords any justification whatever for the concluding paragraphs of Mr. Mannering's letter. No one familiar with the old horse and cattle passes of the Alps or Caucasus can accept Mr. Mannering's final dictum, which is contrary to all our experience. The Gries was used even in winter by the Bernese peasants when they were hard pressed for food and had to fetch maize from Italy.

But, it has been urged, the pass does not fulfil the technical definition of the Government, since it is 'not free from snow or ice for three months every year.' Here we lay our fingers on the surveyors' shortcoming. They failed from want of Alpine experience to realise and point out to the Government, until too late, that its requirement of freedom from summer snow or ice was, in the case of a serviceable horse-track, excessive and superfluous. By their too literal and dumb acceptance of the letter of their instructions the surveyors left the object for which they were sent out—the discovery of a track by which a circuit of at least 100 miles might

* See Mr. Douglas's and Mr. Harper's Reports and Maps.

be avoided, and The Hermitage brought within one day of the West Coast—to be accomplished after thirty years of vain efforts,* by a young amateur and an Alpine guide, who had this one advantage—familiarity with such old trade-routes as the Gries and the Monte Moro, on which a considerable amount of snow and ice has proved for centuries no obstacle to traffic.

I trust that the foregoing statement, by showing how immaterial most of the points in dispute really are, will tend to allay any irritation that still exists in the minds of colonial surveyors and climbers, who may naturally feel a sort of property in their own mountains, and find difficulty in resigning themselves to the chance that led to two visitors being the first to cross what Mr. Harper believes will be the trans-insular pass of the future from The Hermitage and the Mackenzie Plains to southern Westland.

The Alpine Club has always been prompt to recognise the feats of courage and endurance performed by survey officers in New Zealand and elsewhere. My own sympathies have been very much with our colonial members in 'the annoyance' they so frankly acknowledge. To those engaged on the same line of research it is always vexatious to be anticipated. Mr. FitzGerald's success in first crossing the Tasman group was naturally a disappointment to those who were just starting—not for the first time—to look for the pass. The way in which the record of his journey was advertised in this country undoubtedly did injustice to the share of the colonists in mountain explorations; the same might be said with regard to his map.† A judicious friend might have suggested certain modifications in his book itself. All this we may admit. But having done so, we have, I think, a right to suggest to the New Zealand climbers that the luck was not all on one side; that Mr. FitzGerald too may have had some ground for annoyance, if no real grievance, in the fact that they were successful in making the first complete ascent of Mount Cook only a few days before his arrival in the island.

'Feelings' are, perhaps, inevitable, though I think mountaineers nowadays give too frequent expression to them. Carried into records—I will not say literature—the worst of feelings is that they are apt to interfere with a clear view of facts. We have now both Mr. FitzGerald's and Mr. Harper's narratives; they supplement one another, and read conjointly will enable the public to do full justice to all concerned. Further bickerings would be a mistake. If mountaineering is henceforth to be classed as a sport and made a matter of keen rivalries, let us all do our best to preserve the good temper and good fellowship which have made us hitherto ready to enjoy our comrades' successes—next to our own.

* Von Haast reported in 1865, 'on the possibility of finding a road to the West Coast across the Mackenzie country,' that no passage existed there anywhere except over glaciers and snow-fields, only to be crossed by experienced mountaineers (*Geology of Canterbury*, p. 106).

† While I was Honorary Secretary of the Royal Geographical Society a rule was made that the sources of all maps issued by the Society should be stated. I recommend a similar practice to publishers and authors.